

1 CHAD A. READLER
2 Acting Assistant Attorney General
GUSTAV W. EYLER
3 Acting Director
Consumer Protection Branch
NATALIE N. SANDERS
4 Trial Attorney
Consumer Protection Branch
U.S. Department of Justice
450 5th Street, NW, Suite 6400-South
Washington, D.C. 20530
Telephone: (202) 598-2208
Facsimile: (202) 514-8742
E-mail: Natalie.N.Sanders@usdoj.gov

5
6
7
8 Attorneys for Plaintiff
9 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
EASTERN DIVISION

29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
1325
1326
1327
1328
1329
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
132

1 Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(f) and Local Rule 26-1, the
2 following attorneys appeared telephonically to meet and confer on September 10, 2018,
3 at 1:00 P.M. PT: undersigned counsel for the United States and Defendants' counsel Mr.
4 Chang. Additional planning telephone conferences took place on July 2, 2018, and
5 August 29, 2018, between aforementioned counsel. The Parties have conferred in order
6 to present jointly this Joint 26(f) Report addressing each of the items set forth in this
7 Court's July 18, 2018 Order Setting Scheduling Conference.

8 **A. Statement of the Case**

9 The United States claims that Defendants manufacture, or have caused to be
10 manufactured, the following adipose (fat) derived products ("CSCTC products"): (1) a
11 "stromal vascular fraction" product (the "SVF product") manufactured from a patient's
12 adipose tissue; (2) a product that combines SVF and Vaccinia Vaccine, Live (the
13 "SVF/Vaccinia product"); and (3) a product containing SVF that has been expanded in
14 culture by a third party (the "expanded SVF product"), and that all such CSCTC
15 products are intended for use in the treatment, cure, or mitigation of various diseases and
16 conditions for which the CSCTC products are not approved. The United States further
17 contends that Defendants' CSCTC products are subject to regulation under the Federal
18 Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act ("FDCA"), including the FDCA's adulteration and
19 misbranding provisions and the FDCA's Current Good Manufacturing Practice
20 ("CGMP") regulations.

21 Defendants contend that they do not manufacture "products," but rather they
22 conduct SVF procedures ("SVF procedures") which are not subject to regulation by the
23 U.S. Food and Drug Administration ("FDA"). Defendants contend that FDA lacks
24 jurisdiction under the FDCA and the U.S. Constitution to regulate Defendants' SVF
25 procedures, and that the SVF procedures are exempt from regulation through the
26 operation of either 21 C.F.R. § 1271.10(a) or the "same surgical procedure exception" of
27 21 C.F.R. § 1271.15(b).

The United States brings this statutory injunction proceeding pursuant to the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. § 332(a), to enjoin Defendants from (1) violating 21 U.S.C. § 331(k) by causing articles of drug to become adulterated within the meaning of 21 U.S.C. § 351(a)(2)(B), and misbranded within the meaning of 21 U.S.C. §§ 352(f)(1), 352(j), and 353(b)(4), while held for sale after shipment of the drugs or one or more of their components in interstate commerce, and from (2) violating 21 U.S.C. § 331(c) by receiving misbranded drugs in interstate commerce and delivering or proffering for delivery such drugs for pay or otherwise.

The United States also seeks that FDA be authorized to inspect Defendants' places of business and all records relating to the receipt, manufacture, processing, packing, labeling, holding, and distribution of any drug and/or drug component to ensure continuing compliance with the terms of the injunction, with the costs of such inspections to be borne by Defendants, as well as costs and other such relief as the Court deems just and proper, including equitable monetary relief.

B. Subject Matter Jurisdiction

In the United States' view, the basis for the Court's subject matter jurisdiction is 21 U.S.C. § 332(a), which authorizes the Court to restrain violations of § 331(c) and (k) of the FDCA. The Court also has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 (federal question), 1337 (commerce), and 1345 (U.S. as plaintiff).

Defendants contest the Court’s jurisdiction and have raised the lack of subject matter jurisdiction as an affirmative defense in their Answer. More specifically, and as stated above, Defendants contend that FDA and this Court lack jurisdiction under the FDCA and the U.S. Constitution to regulate Defendants’ SVF procedures.

C. Legal Issues

Based on the Complaint and Defendants' Answer, the issues as presently known to the Parties are as follows:

- a. Whether the Defendants' purported practices involve "drugs" within the meaning of the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. § 321(g)(1)(B), (C), and relevant regulations, 21 C.F.R. § 201.128;
- b. Whether the Defendants' purported practices involve "prescription drugs" within the meaning of the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. § 353(b)(1)(A);
- c. Whether the Defendants' purported practices involve "new drugs" within the meaning of the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. § 321(p)(1) and/or 21 U.S.C. § 321(p)(2);
- d. Whether the Defendants' purported practices involve "biological products" within the meaning of the Public Health Service Act ("PHSA"), 42 U.S.C. § 262(i);
- e. Whether the Defendants' purported practices involve "human cells, tissues, or cellular or tissue-based products" ("HCT/Ps"), defined as "articles containing or consisting of human cells or tissues that are intended for implantation, transplantation, infusion, or transfer into a human recipient." 21 C.F.R. § 1271.3(d);
- f. Whether the Defendants' CSCTC products/SVF procedures qualify for the "same surgical procedure exception" in 21 C.F.R. § 1271.15(b);
- g. Whether the Defendants' CSCTC products/SVF procedures meet all of the criteria in 21 C.F.R. § 1271.10(a) for regulation solely under the PHSA and 21 C.F.R. Part 1271;
- h. Whether the FDA lacks jurisdiction under the FDCA, the U.S. Constitution, or otherwise to regulate Defendants' CSCTC products/SVF procedures.
- i. Whether the Defendants' purported practices use methods, facilities, and controls that conform to CGMP. *See* 21 U.S.C. § 351(a)(2)(B) and 21 C.F.R. Parts 210-211; *see also* 21 C.F.R. Parts 600-680 (setting forth additional standards and manufacturing requirements applicable to biological products);

- 1 j. Whether the Defendants' CSCTC products, as alleged in the Complaint, are
2 adulterated within the meaning of the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. § 351(a)(2)(B), or
3 misbranded within the meaning of the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. § 352(f)(1) or
4 353(b)(4);
5 k. Whether the Defendants' SVF/Vaccinia product, as alleged in the
6 Complaint, is misbranded within the meaning of the FDCA, 21 U.S.C. §
7 352(j);
8 l. Whether Defendants violate 21 U.S.C. § 331(k) by causing the adulteration
9 of CSCTC products within the meaning of 21 U.S.C. § 351(a)(2)(B);
10 m. Whether Defendants violate 21 U.S.C. § 331(k) by causing the misbranding
11 of CSCTC products within the meaning of 21 U.S.C. § 352(f)(1), 352(j),
12 and 353(b)(4); and
13 n. Whether Defendants violate 21 U.S.C. § 331(c) by receiving in interstate
14 commerce and delivering or proffering for delivery drugs that are
15 misbranded within the meaning of 21 U.S.C. §§ 352(f)(1) and 353(b)(4);

16 **D. Parties, Evidence, etc.**

17 *Parties*

18 Plaintiff – United States

19 Defendants – CSCTC, CSN, Lander, and Berman

20 *Plaintiff's Evidence*

21 In addition to the witnesses and documents identified by the Defendants, the
22 United States identifies the following witnesses and documents. Additional witnesses
23 and documents may come to light upon discovery and the United States reserves the
24 right to make revisions.

25 *Witnesses*

- 26 1. Karlton Watson, Program Division Director
- 27 2. Catherine Quinlan, Director of Compliance Branch
- 28 3. Sam Labinjo, Compliance Officer

- 1 4. Daniel Cline, Compliance Officer
- 2 5. Randall Morris, Compliance Officer
- 3 6. William Frederick Lagud, Jr., Consumer Safety Officer
- 4 7. Cynthia Jim, Consumer Safety Officer
- 5 8. Darla J. Christopher, Consumer Safety Officer
- 6 9. Michele L. Forster, Consumer Safety Officer
- 7 10. Kip Hanks, Consumer Safety Officer
- 8 11. Cody Rickman, Consumer Safety Officer
- 9 12. Christopher C. Joneckis, PhD, Associate Director for Review Management
- 10 13. Shawntae Dowell, Surgical Technologist
- 11 14. Brittany White, Surgical Technologist
- 12 15. Judi E. Meglio, Office Manager
- 13 16. Audrey Fianza, Certified Scrub/Surgical Technologist

14 *Key Documents*

- 15 1. Inspectional Observations (“Forms FDA 483”)
- 16 2. Establishment Inspection Reports (“EIRs”)
- 17 3. FDA Sample Collection Reports
- 18 4. Consumer Complaints
- 19 5. Published Articles
- 20 6. Files downloaded from the internet
- 21 7. Correspondence between FDA and Defendants

22 *Defendants’ Evidence*

23 In addition to the witnesses and documents identified by the United States,
24 Defendants identify the following additional witnesses and documents in this action.
25 Additional witnesses and documents may come to light upon discovery and Defendants
26 reserve the right to make revisions.

27 *Witnesses*

- 28 1. Defendant Berman

- 1 2. Defendant Lander
- 2 3. Sean Berman
- 3 4. CSCTC and CSN patients

4 *Key Documents*

- 5 1. FDA statements regarding the pertinent regulatory scheme, including the
6 Same Surgical Procedure Exemption
- 7 2. Communications between FDA and Defendants
- 8 3. Non-privileged internal FDA communications about Defendants
- 9 4. Non-privileged internal FDA communications about SVF procedures
- 10 5. Scientific articles regarding the Defendants' SVF procedures
- 11 6. Documents describing the Defendants' SVF procedures

12 **E. Damages**

13 Not applicable.

14 **F. Insurance**

15 Not applicable.

16 **G. Motions**

17 The Parties do not anticipate filing any motions to add parties or claims, amend
18 the pleadings, or transfer venue at this time, but may seek leave to do so depending on
19 the results of discovery.

20 **H. Manual for Complex Litigation**

21 The Parties agree that this is not a matter requiring the Manual for Complex
22 Litigation.

23 **I. Status of Discovery**

24 The Parties have satisfied their meet and confer obligations under Federal Rule of
25 Civil Procedure 26(f), Local Rule 26-1, and this Court's July 18, 2018 Order Setting
26 Scheduling Conference.

27 The Parties will exchange their Rule 26(a) Initial Disclosures on September 24,
28 2018. Due to the breadth and scope of this case, both Parties reasonably expect that

1 supplemental disclosures may have to be made pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil
2 Procedure 26(e).

3 The Parties intend to propound requests for admission and interrogatories on the
4 topics outlined in section C above, with responses due within thirty (30) days of service.

5 Additionally, the Parties continue to work towards a set of facts that can be
6 stipulated to without discovery.

7 **J. Discovery Plan**

8 Proposed Changes to Rule 26(a) Disclosures

9 The Parties agree that no changes to the disclosures under Federal Rule of Civil
10 Procedure 26(a) are necessary. The Parties will exchange initial disclosures on
11 September 24, 2018, and have agreed, consistent with their obligations under Federal
12 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(e), to amend their disclosures as new information becomes
13 available.

14 Discovery

15 Because the disputed matters in this case involve largely legal issues, the Parties
16 agree that discovery should be conducted in phases in accordance with the schedule set
17 forth below.

18 The Parties propose that the first phase of discovery will consist of the United
19 States disclosing to Defendants documents and records related to FDA's inspections of
20 Defendants' facilities that occurred between June 17 and June 27, 2017, as well as a
21 round of interrogatories and requests for admission from each Party to the extent
22 necessary to address material facts in dispute. Among other things, the Parties intend to
23 propound interrogatories and requests for admission relating to the allegations in FDA's
24 Complaint, Defendants' affirmative defenses, and the topics outlined in Section C above.
25 The Parties believe that a limited phase of discovery should likely enable the Parties to
26 fully brief dispositive motions for summary judgment framing the contested legal issues
27 for the Court, while at the same time conserving the Parties' resources by not taking or
28 defending depositions or responding to requests for production unnecessarily.

Out of an abundance of caution, however, the Parties propose an additional phase of discovery involving depositions and requests for production, to the extent such is even necessary to address genuine issues of fact remaining after the initial phase of discovery is completed. The chart below outlines the Parties' discovery plan and what discovery they intend to conduct at each phase of the discovery process:

DEADLINE OR EVENT	AGREED DATE
Phase 1 Discovery Begins (all claims and defenses) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requests for Admissions • Interrogatories 	September 14, 2018 (first day Requests for Admission and Interrogatories may be served)
Production to Defendants of documents and records related to FDA's inspection of Defendants' facilities that occurred between June 17 - 27, 2017	September 24, 2018
Last Date to Amend Pleadings or Add Parties without leave of Court	November 15, 2018
Deadline for completion of all Phase 1 discovery	December 17, 2018
Phase 2 Discovery Begins (remaining issues of material fact) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depositions (as needed) • Requests for Production (as needed) 	December 17, 2018 (first day Requests for Production and Deposition Notices may be served)
Disclosure of Expert Report(s) – initial	January 7, 2019
Disclosure of Expert Report(s) – rebuttal	February 6, 2019
Deadline for completion of all Phase 2 discovery (including hearing all discovery motions)	March 31, 2019

1	Last date to conduct settlement conference	April 30, 2019
2	Deadline to file all motions, including judgment motions, motions related to summary judgment, and <i>Daubert</i> motions	May 31, 2019
3	Deadline to argue/hear all non-discovery motions	June 24, 2019
4	Deadline to file all other trial-related motions, including motions <i>in limine</i> directed towards trial evidence	July 8, 2019
5	Deadline to file Memorandum of Contentions of Fact and Law; Witness Lists; Joint Exhibit List; and Oppositions to motions in limine	July 15, 2019
6	Deadline to file Proposed final pretrial conference order; Proposed jury instructions, and any objections; Proposed verdict forms; and Statement of the case	July 22, 2019

13

14 *Electronically Stored Information*

15 The Parties do not expect that there will be significant electronically stored
 16 information (“ESI”) relevant to the claims and defenses in this case. The Parties have
 17 engaged in discussions to develop a plan that is proportional and reasonable in relation to
 18 the nature of the complexity of the case, for the preservation, identification and
 19 production of the relevant ESI. See Parties’ Joint Plan for Discovery of Electronically
 20 Stored Information, attached as Exhibit B.

21 *Claims of Privilege*

22 In the event that discovery should need to proceed beyond the first phase of
 23 discovery, the United States anticipates filing a protective order shielding from discovery
 24 any agency documents or communications that are covered by any applicable privilege,
 25 including the deliberative process or law enforcement investigatory privileges. The
 26 Parties will confer in a good-faith effort to reach an agreed-upon protective order, which
 27 the Defendants reserve the right to contest.

1 The Parties agree to use the procedures set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
2 Procedure 26(b)(5) to resolve any disputes regarding claims of privilege or protecting
3 materials asserted as being for trial-preparation. The parties request that this proposed
4 procedure be adopted within the Court's further orders.

5 **K. Discovery Cut-off**

6 See Schedule of Pretrial and Trial Dates, attached as Exhibit A.

7 **L. Expert Discovery**

8 See Exhibit A.

9 **M. Dispositive Motions**

10 Following sufficient discovery, the Parties expect to file motions for summary
11 judgment or adjudication on some or all of their claims, as well as any motions *in limine*
12 dictated by discovery. In particular, the Parties anticipate moving for summary
13 judgment or partial summary judgement, in part, on the threshold legal question of
14 whether FDA has authority under the FDCA and the Constitution to regulate
15 Defendants' CSCTC products/SVF procedures.

16 **N. Settlement/Alternative Dispute Resolution**

17 The Parties have discussed settlement at length, including during in-person
18 meetings attended by counsel for the Parties and for FDA on April 27, 2018, and on May
19 8, 2018. Despite the Parties' good-faith attempts at settlement, a negotiated resolution
20 does not appear likely prior to the Court's resolution of the threshold legal issues
21 concerning the applicability of the FDCA to the Defendants' CSCTC products/SVF
22 procedures. Thereafter, the Parties agree to utilize the Court Mediation Panel.

23 **O. Trial Estimate**

24 The Parties do not request a jury trial. The Parties expect the trial to take 5-7
25 days. At this time, the United States contemplates calling 15 witnesses, and Defendants
26 anticipate calling 15 witnesses. The Parties reserve the right to call additional witnesses.

1 **P. Trial Counsel**

2 Trial counsel will include Natalie Sanders for the United States and Celeste Brecht
3 and Witt Chang of Venable LLP for the Defendants.

4 **Q. Independent Expert or Master**

5 At this time, the Parties agree that there is no need for an independent scientific
6 expert or for a master pursuant to Rule 53, but the Parties respectfully request that a
7 reference be available should a need arise.

8 **R. Timetable**

9 See Exhibit A.

10 **S. Other Issues**

11 As noted above, the Parties anticipate that limited discovery will enable the Parties
12 to brief dispositive motions for summary judgment framing the threshold legal issues for
13 the Court. In the event that discovery should need to proceed beyond the first phase of
14 discovery, the United States on behalf of FDA anticipates filing a protective order for
15 any depositions of FDA personnel not involved in the inspections of Defendants'
16 facilities leading to the instant cause of action. The Parties will confer in a good-faith
17 effort to determine whether such a protective order is necessary. Defendants expressly
18 reserve all rights to contest the need or scope of such a protective order, and expressly
19 reserve all rights to notice the deposition of any witness who may possess relevant
20 knowledge. Similarly, the United States on behalf of the FDA would anticipate filing a
21 protective order shielding from discovery any agency documents or communications that
22 are covered by any applicable privilege, including the deliberative process or law
23 enforcement investigatory privileges. The Parties will confer in a good-faith effort to
24 determine whether such a protective order is necessary. Defendants expressly reserve all
25 rights to contest the need or scope of such a protective order, and expressly reserve all
26 rights to seek and compel the production of all relevant documents and communications.

1 CHAD A. READLER
2 United States Department of Justice
3 Acting Assistant Attorney General
4 Civil Division

5 GUSTAV W. EYLER
6 Acting Director
7 Consumer Protection Branch

8 /s/ Natalie N. Sanders
9 NATALIE N. SANDERS
10 Trial Attorney
11 Consumer Protection Branch

12 Attorneys for Plaintiff
13 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

14 /s/ Witt W. Chang
15 CELESTE M. BRECHT, Partner
16 WITT W. CHANG, Associate
17 Venable LLP

18 Attorneys for Defendants
19 CALIFORNIA STELL CELL
20 TREATMENT CENTER, INC.,
21 et al.

22 All signatories listed on whose behalf this filing is submitted concur in the filing's
23 content and have authorized the filing (L.R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i)).

24 Exhibit A: Schedule of Pretrial and Trial Dates Worksheet

25 Exhibit B: Joint Plan for Discovery of Electronically Stored Information

1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2 I hereby certify that on this 17th day of September 2018, I electronically filed
3 a true and correct copy of the foregoing JOINT RULE 26(F) REPORT through the
4 Court's CM/ECF system, which will send a notice of electronic filing to the following:

5 Celeste M. Brecht
6 Witt W. Chang
7 VENABLE LLP

8
9
10 */s/ Natalie N. Sanders* _____
11 NATALIE N. SANDERS

12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28